



SILENT CRUSADE?¹

INDIGENOUS WOMEN IN TAIWANESE INDIGENOUS MOVEMENTS

JOLAN HSIEH

National Dong Hwa University (NDHU), Taiwan

Among the various indigenous rights movements across different times in Taiwan, the presence of indigenous women often goes obscure. Although in recent years there has been a great deal of publications on Taiwanese indigenous movements, some of the literature —constructed under the structure of the indigenous knowledge system—, while insisting on the status and value of indigenous autonomy, tend to overlook the historical context in Taiwanese society of indigenous women who participated in social movements. What are the issues of concern? This paper primarily serves to reveal the “silent crusades” and to bring forward the directions of interests of the indigenous women’s movements by analyzing related reports, autobiographies, interview transcripts, texts, etc. spanning over two decades and published in the weekly newspaper of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (PCT), *Taiwan Church News*, in addition to in-depth interviews with the leaders of indigenous women’s social movements.

KEY WORDS: indigenous peoples, social movement, collective rights, justice.

Cruzada silenciosa? Las mujeres indígenas en los movimientos indígenas taiwaneses

Las mujeres indígenas suelen pasar inadvertidas en los diversos movimientos que, a lo largo de los años, reivindican los derechos indígenas en Taiwan. A pesar de que en los últimos años ha habido una gran cantidad de publicaciones sobre los movimientos indígenas en Taiwan, parte de este corpus —construido bajo la estructura del sistema de conocimiento indígena— al insistir en el estatus y el valor de la autonomía indígena tiende a pasar por alto el contexto histórico dentro de la sociedad taiwanesa de las mujeres indígenas que participaron en los movimientos sociales. ¿Cuáles son los principales ejes de interés? Este artículo busca poner de manifiesto las “cruzadas silenciosas” y los principales temas que conciernen a las movimientos de mujeres

¹ “Silent Crusade” is derived from the “First Indigenous Women’s Forum” (*Taiwan Church News*, 2001) on November 11-13, 2001, jointly organized by the Taiwan Indigenous Female Ministers Association, the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan Women’s Ministry Commission, and the Taiwan Presbyterian Indigenous Missionary Committee. The purpose of this forum is to fight against the fact that indigenous women do not have proper vocal space nor are seen in the public domain. Thus, this paper uses the term followed by a question mark to emphasize the meaningful existence of the indigenous women’s movement in Taiwan long before its public recognition.

indígenas por medio del análisis de reportes, autobiografías, entrevistas, y textos en general publicados a lo largo de dos décadas en el periódico semanal de la Iglesia Presbiteriana de Taiwan (PCT), el *Taiwan Church News*, además de entrevistas en profundidad con las líderes de los movimientos sociales de mujeres indígenas.

PALABRAS CLAVE: pueblos indígenas, movimiento social, derechos colectivos, justicia.

During the 1980s Taiwan writhed in the midst of urges of reform, social protests, and struggles for democracy and civil rights; “non-partisan” (non-Kuo Ming Tang, the Chinese Nationalist Party, and KMT hereafter) civilians formed coalitions that gathered resistance forces all around the country. These campaigns actively advocated for the reform of the KMT government —the single-party dominant authoritarian regime— and diverged about various lines of action which were prompted by different issues. In 1987, unable to contain people’s quest for democracy, the KMT government officially lifted the martial law —a critical milestone for democracy in Taiwan (Hsiao, 1989). In such times of unsettling, confusing, and complicated political climate under the repressive regime, the collective street movements of Taiwanese indigenous peoples gradually emerged from these political reform rallies as the native people and the masters of Taiwan.

Compared with other social movements in Taiwanese society, the descriptions of the indigenous population and their women’s participation in mainstream social movements have elicited weaker criticism or it has developed later. However, when this fact was examined from the perspective of Taiwanese indigenous peoples’ awareness of indigenous sovereignty, as well as of the experience of being indigenous women, it becomes clear that the indigenous nations are not passive respondents to Taiwanese history and issues. The traces of their participation were often wrongfully distorted or neglected, making the indigenous people the absent “protagonists” in social movements. The relationship between the rising of indigenous women’s feminist consciousness and their identification as indigenous peoples is intertwined and complex, but not much attention has been paid to it in Taiwan. Nevertheless, we should recognize that the history of indigenous movements is contemporaneous with the larger context of social movement in Taiwan and can be traced back to over thirty years. Even more importantly, we should recognize indigenous women’s active participation in the movement, which is evident from their collective experience of great discrimination and oppression to their fights for their sustainable survival as indigenous peoples.

There are three main Taiwanese indigenous movements that vehiculate three major claims: name rectification (self-claim for identity rights), land return (land rights), and the establishment of self-government (sovereign rights). First, to effectively demonstrate the sovereignty of the autonomy, the Taiwanese government demanded each indigenous nation to use the Romanization system in the

presentation of indigenous traditional naming practice in order to preserve and restore the traditional names of every individual, lands/territories, and indigenous nations. Secondly, land and resources are linked, as the loss of land leads to the loss of culture, languages, and identity. The Taiwanese people protested against the avarice toward indigenous lands and territories of all colonial governments from the Dutch colonial era to the KMT regime, targeting particularly the nationalization of the “ownerless lands” during the Japanese era and the KMT government’s embezzlement of the indigenous lands via land nationalization and state industries. The immense loss of indigenous traditional territories is one of the vital factors that caused the assimilation of indigenous groups and subsequently the rapid extinction of cultures. Each colonial government in Taiwan’s history used inappropriate ways to deprive the native populations of their lands. Finally, the issue of “who we are” and “land ownership” has been brought forth to demand the return of land and identity to the indigenous peoples as well as their right to fight for self-governance (Hsie, 1987; Shih, 1998; Huang, 2005).

The narrative of the above-mentioned indigenous movements has consistently not mentioned or noticed the participation of indigenous women. Although in recent years there has been a great deal of publications on Taiwanese indigenous social movements, some of the literature—constructed under the structure of the indigenous tribal knowledge system—while insisting on the status and value of indigenous autonomy tends to overlook the historical context of indigenous women in Taiwanese society who participated in social movements. The present paper aims to reveal this “silent crusade” and to bring forward the directions of the interests of the indigenous women’s movements by analyzing related reports, autobiographies, interview transcripts, texts, etc. spanning over two decades (between 1986 and 2005). These documents proceed from the weekly newspaper of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (PCT hereafter), *Taiwan Church News*, in addition to in-depth interviews with the leaders of indigenous women’s social movements.² This research attempts to reveal the developing

² Although this is derived from an earlier research that conducts an analysis of literature and data that span twenty years, the follow-up is ongoing and up-to-date. With in-depth interviews we were able to complement the development of these movements after the year 2005. The PCT periodically publishes *Taiwan Church News* which is the main Presbyterian Church media platform, and it is also the first newspaper in Taiwan. Whether it was PCT-related news, activities, or church development, these, together with a variety of other articles, would all be published in this particular publication. Because of the caring orientation of the church, indigenous churches and their ministers would participate in symposiums, seminars, protests held by the Taiwan indigenous movements and, as a result, detailed reports and records about the indigenous movements can also be found in this newspaper. *Taiwan Church News* is the indispensable source of historical documents. Atayal woman Lawa Pusin (2008) and Truku woman Bakkan Nubuq (2013) also based their research on Taiwanese indigenous movements on an analysis of *Taiwan Church News*.

trends in indigenous women's movements and to provide solid evidence of the existing patriarchal and Han-Chinese thought, in hope of rectifying the previous publications that primarily focus on indigenous men and Han-Chinese women.

“Sameness” and “differences” of gender/ethnicity/class

In the post-1980s Taiwan organizations of women's movements and indigenous movements along with people sharing similar concerns collaboratively took to the streets to fight for the improvement of the lives of women and the underprivileged in Taiwan, and to gradually stop people from overlooking the unequal treatment on the basis of sex/gender, ethnicity, and class. The demonstrations demanded specific reforms of the many regulations in the national system and laws to help heal the historical traumas and to compensate people that had been exploited due to past injustices. As far as feminist movements are concerned, many are taking the initiative in researching the feminist awakening of self-consciousness, (trans-)gender studies and their local application, the strategies of those movements, and so on (Wang, 1999). Influenced by both Western feminist thought and the Taiwanese women's social progress, the movement pushed for women's participation in politics (in the public sphere), legal protection of women's rights, the overthrow of “patriarchal” values, and sought to contribute to the flourishing of publications on Taiwanese women's movements.

However, if one conforms to the mainstream feminist context of development by applying the framework of middle to upper-class white women in the West and non-Western women in developing countries to the understanding of Taiwanese women and Taiwanese indigenous women, one tends to generalize all Taiwanese women into a single group, ignoring differences among women. In other words, not every woman in Taiwan faces sexism the same way, or the same pressure of longstanding historical male dominance, and, as such, they don't need the same process of liberation in their pursuit of sexual liberation and individuality. From this perspective, this research re-examines the literature of women's movements and their partnership with indigenous women and finds that the depth of analysis and level of application to existing theories of Taiwanese indigenous women's studies is rather weak, compared to general gender studies'. This is due to the fact that the literature of the feminist movements is saturated with Western feminist and colonial models, which assume that all women, middle-class and employed, have the same mainstream education, are middle-class and support sex liberation groups (Liglav, 1998; Legeanne interview note, 2006/8/23; Ubin Maray interview note, 2007/4/8).

Are indigenous women far less interested in the so-called “gender issues/women's quest” than their non-indigenous counterparts? Or, must their issues be interlaced with, and not supposed to separate from, “indigenous issues”? If one thinks about how gender issues are set, one could understand the reason for indigenous women expressing that the mainstream gender issues

typically seem not to concern them. This also goes to show that the norm of ethical experience does not fit the actual lifestyles of the indigenous women, or that they feel excluded in the process of setting the mainstream gender issues.

It seems Han Chinese women are dominating the feminist discourses and resources, making it difficult for indigenous women to make their concerns visible or heard, or to simply express their interests in joining the conversation for a collective sisterhood. Unless indigenous women fight for and insist upon their visibility, it would otherwise go unnoticed. The imbalance between indigenous women and the Han Chinese is obvious, resulting in the different understanding of feminist discourses. Furthermore, due to differences in life experiences, indigenous women are often confronted with hostile feelings when participating in the public sphere. These experiences repeatedly happen in the patriarchal societies or in certain ethnic-dominant environments, even when nowadays Gender Mainstreaming Policy is stressed. Women's status and their rights to be heard remain too often ignored and can only be acquired after fighting for "fully and effective" participation and demanding policy-making.

In all walks of life, indigenous women often receive deferential treatment but are in fact treated separately. For example, Chen Hsiao-Huai talks about her participation in the promotion of the *Rainbow Project* with the PCT Women's Ministry Committee, and states that it "later on turned out to be the *supplements* or *add-on* of the indigenous material for flavor" (Chen Hsiao-Huai interview note, 2007/4/18). Chen also indicates that this experience shows that the mainstream women's rights advocate groups make decisions based on political correctness at the expense of indigenous women's decision-making rights and power. Chen further points out that indigenous women are only supplementary to the feminist issues. Not only are the resources and control dominated by the majority of Han Chinese people/women (and some indigenous men), but also Han Chinese people/women often play the role of "prophets or saviors" in deciding and drafting the issues, bracketing indigenous women's problems to themselves, to be solved elsewhere.

To consider women's issues with a Chinese-centered mindset is to monopolize the discursive space concerning ethnic differences and distinctiveness, and to deprive indigenous women of their rights to decide on their own about the issues that concern them. If we truly want to find resolution to indigenous groups' problems, we should not overly romanticize sisterhood between Han Chinese and indigenous people, and also face the differences and conflicts between classes and ethnicities in honesty. If Taiwan as mother earth is a common symbol that most Taiwanese women agree to, then why does a rift exist among women of different ethnicities/classes? Why do indigenous women still feel *secondary*, *isolated*, *supplementary*, and *mediated*?

In addition to the difference in ethnic experience within the Taiwanese feminist movements, we should also take into consideration the *gender difference*

within and among different indigenous or ethnic groups. Given the history of indigenous social movements since 1980, this research finds that there is almost no discussion that takes into account the perspective of the indigenous woman. A close re-examination of the indigenous movements reveals that indigenous women were oppressed by the male elites, especially at the decision-making and leadership levels, and that the core authority is still male-dominated (Lawa, 2008; Ma, 2006). Without fully appreciating the richness of the ethnic tradition, they eliminate the voices of indigenous women precisely in the name of said tradition and deny women access to leadership. This “fake” tradition might be a kind of twisted or distorted phenomenon of post-colonization. Indigenous women have bluntly exposed the contradictions of indigenous male elites who, while they rally for anti-prostitution movements openly, continue to visit night clubs for drinks and call-girls, which is nothing but another kind of ethnicity exploitation, on the one hand, and a way of treating women as consumption goods, on the other.

Incidents such as the unequal work distribution in the indigenous movements, the neglect of the voices of indigenous women, and the absence of the record of women’s participation in the movement abound. There are very few attempts to explore the intertwining relationship between gender and ethnicity and mainstream discourses and the mass media has failed to provide balanced reports and discussions on these issues. For instance, the interviewer of this research pointed out that the collective stigma caused by the recent discourses on the anti-prostitution movement did not generate any kind of reflection upon the inequality of the social structure that favors the practice of prostitution. Rather, mainstream society consistently points out that it is an “education problem” of the indigenous peoples (Liao, 1986a & 1986b).

Another example of the omissions referenced to is the story of Lyiking Yuma, the social movement activist who fought for the rectification of indigenous names for twenty years. She was the only female cadre of the Taiwanese Association for Indigenous Rights Promotion (TAIRP). She participated in all the struggles, from the time when they advocated for the right to bear their traditional names to the fight for the right of land ownership, and then for the right of autonomy. Even after having returned to her indigenous community for more than ten years, Lyiking Yuma still believes that, in order to let indigenous peoples understand the nature of their oppression and marginalization, and to effect change, political activities must be engaged in (Lyiking, 1998). However, in the official history of the indigenous movements, led by men, it should be inquired where are the positions of these women noted. In the case of the compilation of the historical indigenous movements records, gathered by the current Council of Indigenous Peoples’ Minister Icyang Parod, very few female activists who were the protagonists of the fight of the indigenous movements were mentioned. When expanding the scope and viewing it from the perspective of the history of the entire Taiwanese social movements, the existence of the indigenous women

who played a main role in the promotion of important social policies has been excluded.

When indigenous women are victims of mistreatment or even during the process of legalizing issues related to sexism, there emerges another tug of war with the authorities in terms of ethnicity, class and gender. In mainstream Taiwan, during the discussion of feminist issues and the making of related policies, indigenous women are often excluded from the core of authority or are only given token positions. Such practice seems to echo the patriarchal system in its oppression of women and also shows that Taiwanese society structures and limits the space where the indigenous women's voice can be heard as it further takes away the basic rights that indigenous women should have. Furthermore, given the colonized nature of indigenous cultures, there is a usual lack of indigenous women's voices and positions regarding gender issues. This also shows that the Han Taiwanese society needs to heed indigenous women's issues, respect indigenous women's voices and positions in the intersecting gender/ethnicity/class matrix, and defend the most basic women's rights as human rights to demonstrate true sisterhood. (Hsieh, 2008)

Taiwanese indigenous women's issues and appeals

The Taiwanese indigenous movement does not equal the Taiwanese indigenous women's movement, even if they would seem to be on parallel tracks. Most of the issues of concern are different subject areas which lead to different directions and developments. Most of the inspirational figures for the Taiwanese women's movements in the 1980s are not indigenous women; these non-indigenous feminist groups started to organize and mobilize to promote together the awakening of movements of feminist consciousness and to collaborate in the enhancement of all women's rights. However, publications and the media rarely targeted indigenous women as the topic in the literature and reports. Three and a half decades later, indigenous women still may not be articulate enough to vocalize their own plight and, as a consequence, they are replaced by researchers armed with articulation skills and access to publications and media. This is a situation similar to what we find in Gayatri C. Spivak's "Can the Subaltern Speak?" (1994), where the researcher voiced for the object of the study, the pariah, and vocalized their plight for them, falling into the paradox of constructive theory. Not only it is true that the discourses of feminist movements have been developed in this castrating way for indigenous women, but also, unexpectedly, indigenous feminist movements seem to be in gradual decline. Owing to the fact that indigenous women's issues are subordinated to the entire development of indigenous ethnicity, through the control of discursive space, indigenous women are left in an ancillary position, and hence are not visible. From the twenty years of data collected from *Taiwan Church News*, this study examines how the participation of these women has been represented in the six main developmental issues: Labor and

Economy, Welfare and Poverty Relief, Education and Culture, Health and Medicine, Safety, and Political Participation. Indigenous women demand not only human rights for indigenous peoples as a whole, but also probe their roles and plights, in an attempt to cross the gender barrier and to challenge the ethnic control from their perspective, i.e., the unfair treatment and discrimination they encounter, the social structure fostered by capitalism, and even the tensions among women. The directions of indigenous women's movements are multifaceted owing to their differences and their multiple perspectives on the issues at hand.

Labor and economy

The main concern here is to show the pernicious influence of errors committed by the colonial governments. The indigenous peoples, since ancient times, use the environment to generate their economy, but the policy of the colonial administration on indigenous areas caused the breakdown of the traditional indigenous lifestyles, which was living off the mountains and the sea. After the exploitation of indigenous lands by the Spanish and Dutch colonial administrations, then by the Cheng Rule and the Manchu colonial government, later by the Japanese and still by the KMT regime, there was not much land left in the possession of the indigenous peoples (Hsieh, 2006). Furthermore, the overall revenue for indigenous peoples is much lower than for Han Chinese society. The career orientation of aborigines is limited to low class hard labor: they tend to be fishermen, truck drivers and miners (Chen, 1985; Icyang [Liu Wen-Hsiung] and Lawagao [Mai Tsun-Lien], 1993).

Welfare and poverty relief

The reports mainly provide information about native women when help or rescue missions are requested of the church. In the period from 1986 to 1987 the reports tend to be about indigenous women's struggles to find jobs, and to be granted medical care and education. These women were unable to support their families, and often faced all kinds of problems and exhaustion in their everyday lives. The media exposure of these stories seeks to call for social support and aid, and, through welfare policies, to eliminate indigenous women's impoverishment.

Education and culture

The writings in this area primarily provide information on related spiritual devotions, women's conferences, and forums, events that range from conferences of women's ministry at the national level to small ones such as sessions to report the results of training sessions, or devotional and ministry services at individual churches. The purpose of these reports is to cooperate in the activities hosted by the department of women's ministry and by the indigenous missionaries' committee of the PCT headquarters, which periodically train women's ministry staff

to organize the resources for women in each presbytery and to spread out the information about said resources. These texts report mostly on the contemporary indigenous talent training and on the indigenous women's expectations toward indigenous education. Another core issue related to indigenous education is how it has gradually become an issue that motivates indigenous women to participate in the local communities, and examples can be found in many education-related articles published by women graduates of the Department of Social Work of Yu Shan Theology College and Seminary. They address issues such as cultural conflicts, care for the indigenous teenagers entering urban environments and their adaptation to city life, single-parenting, grandparents raising grandchildren, alcoholic parents and unwed mothers. 1994 marks the beginning of the publication of articles on indigenous feminist consciousness awakening, but the golden era comes after 1997. This body of literature mainly discusses indigenous women's roles, employment struggles, gender discrimination in the PCT staffing, etc. At the same time, this stage is also permeated by the influence of international women's movements; indigenous female pastors who participated in international conferences returned with an experience that influenced the decisions of the women's ministry committee and led them to include the department of indigenous women's ministry as one of their collaborative advocate groups. Furthermore, in terms of leadership training of indigenous females, indigenous women leaders were trained actively in accordance to the indigenous women's situation of the moment, in hope of decreasing problems such as indigenous human trafficking and low-income. At the beginning of the indigenous feminist movements, it was the elite leaders that were trained to solve social problems; later, the focus on training shifted to church staff, such as wives of pastors, elders, and committee members of indigenous women's ministry. From these data we could tell indigenous women preachers are already capable of working independently in the pastoral processes, tribes, and communities they belong to.

Health and medicine

The main discussion focuses on the phenomenon of unfortunate indigenous underage girls who practiced unlicensed prostitution which led to syphilis and AIDS contraction in the 80s. *Taiwan Church News* quotes the example of sex tourism in Thailand and proposed that our government should investigate and track down the indigenous girls engaging in sexual trade. Many articles point out that AIDS is not only a medical and health issue, but that it also reflects socio-structural problems in national policies, human rights, and religion. They therefore recommend that the church work with hospitals and families to form a patient-care network, and to control the occurrences of prostitution in indigenous minors (Hsu, 1993).

Safety

The anti-minor-prostitution movement has long been the principal axis of action for the indigenous women's movements, to fight against the promoters of the commercialization of indigenous women and girls, and basically believe that the indigenous women's movement exists only to fight against the prostitution of minors during the 1980s. However, after thoroughly perusing the reports and interview data, it is evident that the preeminence of this issue stems from the fact that it is a vehicle for the negative stereotypical image of the indigenous community held by the general Taiwanese society and it does so by ignoring the crux of the entire structural problems that make prostitution the only way out for so many indigenous minors. The discussion of such social issues signals the consolidation of the history of indigenous women's resistance, in particular the anti-minor prostitution campaign. From 1986 to 2004 anti-child prostitution movement related reports continued to occupy most of the pages of *TCN*. During this period of time, the image of indigenous women was influenced by the media, and was the result of the long-term "child prostitution" image; indigenous women were mostly stigmatized as being wild, less moral and more prone to indulgence. Thereafter, discriminative perspectives came along and criticism emphasized that indigenous women overall needed to be re-educated and to reconstruct their moral character.

Political participation

In this particular area, it is worth mentioning the work of Chiu Chien-Hua, a Bunun pastor, also the second president of the Taiwan Indigenous Female Ministers Association, who was invited by the PCT to travel to the United Kingdom in June 1989 to participate in the Council for World Mission (CWM hereafter) at St. Andrews University in Scotland. Upon her return, she finished her book *Women's Important Exist: CWM Meeting Report* (Chiu, 1989). Some specific concerns voiced in the report brought up certain challenges and varying visions to the PCT Women's Ministries. For example, it was suggested that women's ministries should work towards the welfare of all women, regardless of ethnicity. With the same resources, these efforts all jointly promote God's mission and connect with the trends of international feminist movements. The substantial role played by the CWM was to open up an international forum for Taiwanese indigenous women and it also helped them to connect with women's groups around the world and to put the *Women's Care Center* in effect. Pastor Legeanne of Paiwan presbytery continues the work of the *Women's Care Center*. CWM has ever since had a major influence over the core narrative of the whole Taiwanese indigenous women's movement.

Existing literature, such as *Indigenous Women Protection Policy*, indicates that indigenous women are most concerned about labor and economy issues (Council of Indigenous Peoples, 2003: 60): *Mulidan-Tribal Diary* raises aware-

ness that indigenous women should be able to be fully and effectively participative and fulfilled (Liglav, 1998: 54) and Legeanne (interview note 2006/8/23) and Ubin Maray (interview note 2007/4/8) also point out that indigenous women are most concerned about economy understood as fulfilling the basic needs. All in all, they demonstrate that the economy is the core concern. In reports of recent years, however, general social issues seem to be emerging as the primary concern for women.

To sum up, while existing literature emphasizes indigenous women's main concern as that of being able to meet basic needs, this study also shows that in addition to essential human needs, indigenous women are concerned about the representation associated with their identity awakening and their resistance. Thus, the indigenous women's awakening movements start off from concerns on subjectivity and education and move on to fight against the history and values of the Han Chinese that have caused the biased and distorted views of indigenous women. That is to say, indigenous women move on to denounce how the cause and effect relationship has been reversed, and blame has been placed on indigenous people when they are in fact the ones being persecuted and therefore in need of defense.

Conclusion

Indigenous women's activism in Taiwan is a body of work, a set of theoretical perspectives and a whole spectrum of political positions and practices. This research analyzes indigenous feminist movements via post-colonial theory so as to reflect the deficiencies and limitations indigenous women currently are bound to by their marginalization in Taiwan. As a multiply oppressed group, indigenous women are positioned to deconstruct the mechanisms of *capitalist, mainstream, male* related literature and to use the results as bases to redefine the meaning of their movements. This developing method of indigenous women's movements, experience-based, resists the possible paths of capitalist exploitation, generalized descriptions found in mainstream literature and male authority. Based on the post-colonialist strategy "from the edge to the core", we see clearly the dialectical relationship among Taiwanese indigenous women, indigenous movements and feminist movements on issues of ethnicity, class, and gender. This essay gathers and reflects upon related pleas of Taiwanese indigenous women's movements as reported in *Taiwan Church News*, and employs them to put forward the idea that neither Taiwan's indigenous movements nor general women's movements sufficiently represent indigenous women's voices and positions.

The analysis of the texts selected reveals that education and culture-related aspects were the most discussed, reflecting that more attention is paid to gender awareness than to personal safety. To a certain degree, the pleas of indigenous feminist movements primarily target ethnic and gender issues. One focus is the call to eliminate the stigmatization of indigenous underage prostitution. Educa-

tion is seen as an instrument that connects indigenous women and makes it possible for them to fight together against an external world for indigenous peoples' visibility and human rights. Therefore, Taiwanese indigenous women's movements focus on ethnic awareness and gender issues, recognizing that to promote the movement they must work on identity recognition and cultural values, the only means through which the true meanings of indigenous women's movements may be revealed.

Although, in the past, the issues of concern for the indigenous women's movements were presented as appeals mostly for education and culture, the reports in the last few years tend to cover more issues related to tribal economic industries and the prevention of domestic violence. One can therefore reasonably predict, given the entire structure of society, that issues related to labor economy will inevitably increase. Taiwan's social movements were allowed to flourish after democratization, which was brought about by the interaction of Taiwanese society's politics and economy. Hence, studies of the late 1980s on the rise of Taiwanese social movements tend to limit themselves to the domains of economic, political and social structures. Kao Cheng-Shu and Hsiao Hsin-Huang (1989) offer a similar viewpoint in their book *Taiwanese New Social Movements* and so do the experiences of indigenous women's movement advocates, such as those narrated by Chen Hsiao-Huai (interview note, 2007/4/17). Chen thinks that poverty in the indigenous community is entirely structural, because indigenous people live within the structure of Han Chinese society, and the democratic mechanism of majority rule does not offer opportunity for indigenous people to participate. Furthermore, if indigenous people inevitably participate in the structure and values of Han Chinese mainstream society from birth to death, how are they to be expected to solve problems of their own?

Today, when the dominant economic paradigm is seen as the main reason behind the continuing environmental and social crisis, the search for alternatives is crucial. Literature on the impoverishment of women in general should not be limited to discussions of "being able to be full" and "women entrepreneurs" (Liglav, 1998; Legeanne 2006/8/23; Afan Lekal 2007/4/18). Instead, one should first employ indigenous women's knowledge and understanding of the phenomenon of indigenous women's poverty as well as the problems and positions of Taiwanese indigenous women. The indigenous economic structure can be appraised in the appeals of indigenous women's movements and their literature in which they reflect the fact that traditional indigenous society places emphasis not on individuals but on shared and collective value, and on how their resources and wealth are not concentrated on a few. Future development to solve the problem of impoverishment among indigenous women and to deepen the roots of tribal industries and models of autonomy, in spite of economic and employment challenges, must be led by local tribes and indigenous people themselves. This line of logic does not stand in opposition to modernization or development, nor

does it trap indigenous groups in “romanticized” remote areas. Rather, it argues that the core of resolution lies in the regeneration of indigenous cultural values and knowledge systems. It is only through such rooted knowledge that we may gradually solve the plights of indigenous women and further develop the entire indigenous economy.

Due to the hard work on local and liberation theology, the PCT directly affects the awakening of movements of Taiwanese indigenous women and indigenous nations. PCT’s “inhabitants’ self-determination theory” implies implementing Christian beliefs to all the cultures, ethnicities, and genders of this land, which enables indigenous women to value their own identities, languages, cultural values, traditional customs, dignity and faith and to defend their land and their rights. Based on these grassroots concepts and actions, through literature, data, and analyses, and with ongoing conversations about living experiences with participants in the indigenous women’s movements, this research reveals the in-depth meaning of the indigenous women’s movement and its issues of concern, and helps to enrich and complicate narratives on Taiwanese women’s movements as well as to illuminate the viewpoints of indigenous women, much lacking in the indigenous movements. It is clear, in the promotion of women’s and indigenous movements in the past, that Taiwanese indigenous women’s movements have always been present, but mainstream society did not offer them equal and just treatment, and that resulted in a “silent crusade”.

In addition to making visible the existence of Taiwan’s indigenous women’s movement, the present paper importantly provides an example of the Taiwanese indigenous knowledge system, which is similar to what Patricia Clough (1994: 193-196) points out in relation to the epistemology of African-American women, which mentioned self-definition as its core for movement. When African-American feminist thought developed into academic knowledge, African-American women gradually found themselves alienated from objective academic knowledge. However, in the same way as the knowledge system of African-American women is not only limited to academic discourses of knowledge, it is also critical of media, history, technological networks, sociology and literature in various fields. When indigenous people use their own experiences as a path to construct knowledge, it is necessary to interpret and reconstruct their hegemonic and counter-hegemonic literature. This would further challenge the mainstream discourse and help advance indigenous cultural values and traditional wisdom into a leading position in knowledge. Furthermore, Joyce Green (2007) believes that the reason why indigenous women around the world hesitate to identify as feminist is due to the stigma of anti-traditionalism. Thus, even though indigenous women are committed to social movements, they often bury their existence and do not explicitly associate themselves with women’s movements. Nevertheless, society at large should not forget that while indigenous women fight for

their own cause, namely recognition and promotion of social reforms, these actions are deeply in line with the original intentions of women's movements.

Maori indigenous scholar Linda T. Smith states that indigenous struggles since the 1970s "seem to be clear and straightforward: the survival of peoples, cultures and languages; the struggle to become self-determining" (1999: 142). As indigenous peoples' anti-colonial political struggles confront the dominant socio-legal-political system worldwide alike, Taiwanese indigenous peoples' fundamental struggle challenges the legitimacy of settler states' claims to sovereignty. Taiwan just elected the country's first woman president in early 2016, Tsai Ing-Wen (Democratic Progressive Party), who also has an indigenous Paiwan grandmother and so it predicts that a bright future ahead might be possible. Newly inaugurated and in her capacity as Taiwan's president, Tsai Ing-Wen apologized, on Indigenous Peoples Day (1 August 2016), to Taiwan's indigenous peoples for sufferings caused by the government. Tsai said in her presidential campaign that indigenous peoples had been oppressed at the hands of a government controlled by a number of foreign regimes. Colonialism has not only left indigenous peoples at a disadvantage in terms of economy, education and health, but it has also reduced indigenous peoples' activism to making claims and assertions about indigenous rights and identity in Taiwan. We Taiwanese indigenous peoples have voiced our struggle to become self-determining, to take control of our destinies, and for the survival of our cultures and languages. The fact that not much has been seen nor heard of indigenous women's movements in Taiwan should not result in the conclusion of its non-existence.

WORKS CITED

- Bakkan, Nubuq (2013), *The Participation of PCT Indigenous Ministers in Social Movements*, Hualien, National Dong Hwa University. [unpublished Master Thesis]
- Chen, Hsiao-Huai (1985), *Indigenous Sex Workers' Issues and Pastoral Care Studies*, Hualien; Yu Shan Theological College and Seminary. [unpublished Master Thesis]
- Chiu, Chen-Hua (1989), "Women's Important Exist: CWM Meeting Report", *Taiwan Church News*, 24 September 1989, No. 1960, 8.
- Clough, Patricia T. (1994), *Feminist Thought: Desire, Power, and Academic Discourse*, Oxford, Blackwell.
- Council of Indigenous Peoples (2003), *Indigenous Women's Rights Protection Policy*, Taipei, Council of Indigenous Peoples.
- Hsiao, Hsin-Huang (1989), "Taiwan Emerging Social Movement Analysis Architecture", pp. 21-46 in Hsu Cheng-Kuang and Soong Wen-Li (eds) *Taiwan's New Social Movement*. Taipei: Mighty Current.

- Hsie, Hsi-Chun (1987), *Identity Stigma—Changes in Taiwan Indigenous Peoples*, Taipei, Independence Evening News.
- Hsieh, Jolan (2008) “UN Women’s World Summit and Human Rights”, *UN World Summit*, Shih Cheng-Feng and Jolan Hsieh (eds.), Taipei, National Prospects Education Foundation: 69-93.
- (2006), *Collective Rights of Indigenous Peoples: Identity-Based Movement of Plain Indigenous in Taiwan*, New York, Routledge.
- , Bakkan Nubuq, and Lawa Pusin (2011), “Taiwan Indigenous Movements: PCT Observation and Perspective”, in *Century Academic Development in Taiwan Conference*, Taipei, September 2011. [conference presentation]
- and Lawa Pusin (2006), “Indigenous Women’s Movement in Taiwan”, in *Kaohsiung International Austronesian Culture Expo International Forum*, Kaohsiung, June 2006. [conference presentation]
- Hsu, Chi-Yun (1993), “How Thai Churches Face the AIDS Crisis”, *Taiwan Church News*, 20 June 1993, No. 2155, 3.
- Huang, Ling-Hua (2005), *The Congressional Route of Taiwan Indigenous Movements*. Taipei: National Prospects Education Foundation.
- Icyang, Parod (ed.) (2008), *Aggregation of Historical Materials on Taiwan Indigenous Social Movements*, Taipei, Academia Historica.
- (Liu Wen-Hsiung) and Lawagao Laigelate (Mai Tsun-Lien) (1993), “Anyone Who, Not Because of the Ethnicity, Enjoys Different Human Rights” (part 2), *Taiwan Church News*, 15 September 1993, No. 2266, 14.
- Green, Joyce (2005), “Taking Account of Aboriginal Feminism”, *Making Space for Indigenous Feminism*, Joyce Green (ed), London, Zed Books.
- Kao, Cheng-Shu (1989), “Taiwan’s New Social Movement Structural Studies”, *Taiwan’s New Social Movement*, Hsu Cheng-Kuang and Soong Wen-Li (eds.), Taipei, Chu Liu: 9-18.
- Lawa, Pusin (2008), *Taiwan Indigenous Women’s Movement: Examining Taiwan Church News (1986-2005)*, Hualien, National Dong Hwa University. [unpublished Master Thesis]
- Liao, Bi-Ying (1986a), “Rainbow Project Introduction”, *Taiwan Church News*, 18 May 1986, No. 1785, 8.
- (1986b), “Their Whole Life? Attention to Indigenous Community’s Human Trafficking Problems”, *Taiwan Church News*, 12 October 1986, No. 1806, 5.
- Liglav, A-Wu (1998), *Mulidan-Tribal Letters*, Taipei, Fembooks Culture.
- Lyiking, Yuma (1998), “From Church and State Relation to Look at the Disintegration and Reconstruction of Indigenous Society and Culture”, *Spiritual Reform, Social Reconstruction, Taiwan Aborigines, Ethnic Rights, Human Rights Symposium*, Lyiking Yuma (ed.), Taipei, Taiwanese Indigenous Tribal Cultural Heritage Association: 345-67.

- Ma, Yun-Jen (2006), *Indigenous Women's Activists: Performing and Identity*, Hualien, National Dong Hwa University. [unpublished Master Thesis]
- Richardson, Alan (1966), *Theological Word Book for the Bible*, Hong Kong, Chinese Christian Literature Council Ltd.
- Shih, Cheng-Feng (1998), *Ethnic Nationalism: Collective Identity of Political Analysis*, Taipei, Vanguard.
- Smith, Linda T. (1999), *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*, London, Zed Books.
- Spivak, Gayatri (1994), "Can the Subaltern Speak?", *Colonial Discourse and Post-Colonial Theory: A Reader*, Patrick Williams and Laura Chrisman (eds.), New York, Columbia University Press: 66-111.
- Taiwan Church News* (2001), "Proposing Silent Indigenous Women's Rights: Indigenous Women No Longer Remain Silent", 25 November 2001, No. 2595, 4.
- Wang, Ya-Ko (1999), *History of Taiwan Women's Liberation Movement*, Taipei, Chu Liu.

